# EXAMPLES OF HIGHLY SCORED 2016-2017 APR REPORTS

**Examples of Highly Scored 2016-2017 APR Reports**

**I. Probe the Results**

**ENGL English AA & AA-T Degrees**

The 2013/2014 Program Review noted that in spring of 2013, only 42.9% of students achieved the PSLO "Evaluate and synthesize credible secondary sources . . ." Since this was consistently the PSLO with the lowest attainment at that time, ENGL 1500 was redesigned (including the removal of a co-requisite), information competency skills were more deeply embedded into other ENGL courses, and collaborations with the reference librarian were enacted throughout subsequent program review cycles. In fall of 2015, 87.62% of students assessed met or exceeded this outcome, in spring of '16, 89.74%. The program changes and interventions appear to be successful.

Last year's program review noted that female and Hispanic students were less likely than other groups to demonstrate the PSLO "Use cultural contexts to comprehend texts." As a result, student equity workers were embedded into selected sections of ENGL 1600, and greater emphasis was placed on the PSLO in courses in the major. 2015/2016 data show that these subpopulations are no longer disproportionately impacted in demonstrating this PSLO, with only 10.06% percent of females failing to demonstrate the outcome compared to 10.67% males, and only 4.3% of Hispanics failing to demonstrate the outcome compared to 11.11% of whites.

In ENGL 800, professor Carlson implemented the Growth Mindset and had a Student Equity Worker (Peer Mentor) in the class two days a week. This helped tremendously. The overall course success rate for fall of 2016 was 78% (independently gathered by instructor) compared to the previous semester, which was 60%--in fall of 2015, it was only 53.8%. This was the result of the targeted intervention to increase pre-collegiate success from last year's APR. Similarly, successful course completion in ENGL 900 increased in 2015/16 as compared with 2014/15, but ENGL 1000's successful completion rate fell by nearly 5%

All PSLOs were assessed, and the PSLO with the lowest level of attainment (by 0.68%) is "Evaluate expository and literary texts," although this PSLO also had the fewest assessments.

Additional data provided by IAR&P indicate that the number of students declaring English as their major and enrolling in at least one ENGL or ESL course is steadily increasing. The number of students declaring English as their major and having attempted at least one ENGL or ESL class has increased to 57 as of fall of 2016, a significant increase from only 29 in fall of 2014. Of these 57, 35 have already completed ENGL 1500, the pre-requistie for list A classes. Several more may complete ENGL 1500 before spring of 2018. The majority of students majoring in English since 2014 who have completed coursework requiring ENGL 1500 as a pre-requisite in the major place into ENGL 1500. Since 2014, only 8 students majoring in ENGL who began below ENGL 1500 completed coursework in the major which includes ENGL 1500 as a pre-requisite. However, only 2 English degrees were awarded--the lowest number since 2011 (since 2008, completers have ranged from 1-8).

**INST SRVCS Distance Learning Support**

According to the Full Time Equivalent Student (FTES) Distance Education (DE) Report from the CCCCO Data Mart site, about one-third of Taft College's FTES has consistently come from Distance Education since the 2009-2010 academic year. Specifically, the percentage of DE FTES for the 2015-2016 academic year was at 35.7%, which is 2.2 percentage points above the 2014-2015 academic year (33.5%). The statewide average of DE FTES is 11.9%.

The DE retention rate for TC in Fall 2015 was 89.91% versus 81.03% statewide. The DE success rate for TC in Fall 2015 was 63.76% versus 62.28% statewide. In Spring 2016, the DE retention rate for TC was 88.73% versus 81.48% statewide. The DE success rate for TC in Spring 2016 was 63.78% versus 63.63% statewide.

In Spring 2016, twelve faculty piloted the use of the Canvas LMS. Based on input from these faculty and on information from the CCC OEI, the Academic Senate approved the adoption of Canvas to begin Summer 2016. Including the twelve pilot faculty, 38 faculty were trained on how to use Canvas for their DE classes.

**PRES Human Resources**

Team HR continues to implement initiatives that will result in supporting Student Learning Objectives (SLOs) and enhance the student success goals at Taft College through the following outcomes as a sample of activities implemented during 2015-16:

1. Increased employee professional development opportunities by more than 5%, for faculty, staff and management. This was provided in multiple formats including and not limited to at Taft College during in-services and on-line via webinars during the 2015-16 year.

2. Increased employee recruitment outreach by more than 10%. This was accomplished using expanded recruiting platforms (Edjoin, Community College.com, Job Elephant, Latinosinhighereducation.com, Blacksinhighereducation.com, Asiansinhighereducation.com).

3. Increased employee diversity of underrepresented groups by more than 1% in the area of Learning Support. The classified and management groups increased by 2% for 2015-16.

4. Increased employee exit interviews and feedback collection by more than 15%.

5. Increased community presentations by more than 25%, including and not limited Kern County Job Fair, Taft Rotary Association.

6. Increased internal HR procedures by more than 10%, including and not limited to the employee exit protocol, exit interviews, selection/screening chair data meetings, new employee orientation, student worker selection and training, ACA reporting, part-time employee work hour tracking.

7. Completed 50% of the Taft College Strategic Action Plan Goal 5.3, Establish a comprehensive staff development plan.

**MATH SCI Natural and Life Sciences**

Life Sciences courses continue to have full wait-lists in half of the Life Science classes offered every semester; to the extent that students must wait to take required courses, sometimes up to a year, they are delayed in completing their degree or transfer requirements. According to the "enrollments" data provided by the Research Office, ALL sections of Biology 2250, 2257 and 2260 (core Allied Health courses) from 2012/13 to 2015/16 are not only filled to capacity but have enough wait-listed students for additional sections if there were enough faculty to offer those sections.

To meet this need, we presented a Life Science position request to the Academic Senate in 2015 and achieved a 4th place score from the Senate, not quite high enough to secure this much needed position. We added 2 additional sections of Fundamentals of Biology, both of which filled to capacity, and an additional Environmental Studies section to give our students more opportunities to complete their educational requirements. We cannot add any additional sections at this time without additional faculty, resources, and lab space. We were unable to attend any conferences, in part due to the fact that we would need to cancel classes because of lack of qualified, available faculty to fill in. The number of students majoring in Liberal Arts Allied Health increased from 276 in 2012/13 to 430 in 2014/15, an increase of 56% in four years with no increase in the number of faculty.

In terms of course success rates, we continue to have high rates of success (80%+) for our 2000-level courses and slightly below that for our Introductory 1500-level students. Regarding performance on SLO's we are still finding it difficult to work in the Elumen format. On that note, we were able to examine results for our BIOL 1510 course (Intro. Biology). The SLO examined the students ability to convert the appropriate DNA strand to mRNA and then to Protein. Approximately 56% of the students had either mastered or met expectations in this area.

**MATH SCI Physical Science**

Success rates for physical sciences range from 70.6 – 100.0% with an average of 85.6%. The lowest success rates are found in off-line distance learning courses taught by adjunct faculty. Physical science course such as chemistry, geology and physics,are reaching a saturation point. We neither have the physical space nor the faculty to meet current demand for course offerings. Often times, the number of wait-listed students would fill additional sections if they were offered. We deactivated our one semester organic chemistry lecture and lab, and replaced it with a one semester introduction to organic and biochemistry to better serve the needs of our allied health field majors.

**II: I Wonder**

**ENGL English AA & AA-T Degrees**

The curricular change to ENGL 1500, inclusion of information competency skills in pre-collegiate English courses, ongoing collaboration with the reference librarian, and heightened emphasis on the PSLO "Evaluate and synthesize credible secondary sources . . . " appears to be successful based on the data above. This project has been a significant focus of program review since 2014.

The targeted interventions in the courses in the major also correlate with female and Hispanic students no longer being disproportionately impacted in demonstrating the cultural/historical context PSLO.

ENGL 800's use of the growth mindset and an embedded student equity worker correlate with increased successful course completion.

ENGL 1000 only began the growth mindset/embedded student equity worker approach in fall of 2016, and we have not yet gathered data on their completion for that term. Reasons for the 5% fall in completion of 1000 in the prior two semesters may include a full-time faculty member having been on medical leave for much of spring semester, leaving unexpectedly midterm; placement; or decreased enrollments in ESL, but the reason is unknown.

The slightly lower attainment of the PSLO "Evaluate expository and literary texts" may be owed to the difficulty of evaluation, or to the smaller sample size/number of students assessed for this outcome compared to other outcomes.

The reason for the reduced number of students awarded an English degree in 2015/2016 is unknown. The changes to the local major and eventual discontinuance of the local major are factors: the older, local English major which many graduating students had catalog rights to and completed in years prior double-counted ENGL 1500 as both general education and major requirement and required one less list A course, making it easier to complete given the low number of offerings per semester. The present and past English Counseling Liaison cite this as a potential cause. The existing AA-T is more difficult to attain. Two students have reported to their instructors that they were completing transfer requirements in English for universities without completing the AA-T, because they could be admitted to English baccalaureate programs more quickly without the Associate's, so while these students met their educational goal, they were not captured by the metric of number of awards. However, according to data through fall of 2016, 11 English majors appear to be able to complete their major requirements in spring of 2017, or already have. At least one student who benefited from the increased course offerings in the major completed her degree requirements in fall of 2016, so was not included in the low number of awards for 2015/2016. Success rates for all list A classes remain high, ranging from 70% to 94.7% in 2015/2016.It is possible that students are experiencing difficulty in coursework outside of the major, but it appears very likely that the number of awards will increase by the end of the spring 2017 term.

**INST SRVCS Distance Learning Support**

In the 2015-2016 academic year, the Distance Learning Instructional Support team had two new activities planned. The first activity was to hire student workers to attempt to make contact with every DE student during first three weeks of the Fall semester. This activity was based on the assumption that by increasing the connections between the DE students and the college, the greater the likelihood that the students will stay engaged with their DE classes. This activity may have positively impacted the retention rates of our Fall 2015 DE students. Credit Retention Rates, as reported from the Data Mart site, for TC DE students did show some improvement in Fall 2015(89.91% vs. 88.22% in Fall 2014).

The second activity planned for the 2015-2016 year involved purchasing textbooks for the TCI and MCCF inmate population. The Distance Learning Support office was not able to implement this activity until Fall 2016.

**PRES Human Resources**

The activities implemented in 2015-16 represent an initial process aligned with assisting Student Learning Objectives (SLOs). These identified activities are used by over 50% of human resource departments of similar sized community colleges. The activities promote an enhanced learning experience in support of identified equal employment opportunities within Taft College and contribute to student success, in the areas of creating and sustaining a learning environment that represents the student community being served. In the effort of meeting that goal, data indicates that Taft College should be more diverse across all employee levels. The effectiveness of activity outcomes will be greatly influenced by the awareness, cooperation and willingness to embrace the best practices of addressing diversity throughout recruitment and hiring.

**MATH SCI Natural and Life Sciences**

By adding extra sections of Biol 1500/1510 and 1513 we were able to accommodate more than 100 additional students. Yea, it worked! It is our feeling that our high course success rates are due to having experienced professors, essential lab materials and equipment, and sufficient lab space for the current sections. Despite these unqualified successes, we strongly feel we can better meet student needs and reduce time-to-degree considerably by offering more sections in the Allied Health program.

The lower success rates in the non-majors 1500-level courses could be due to limited resources outside of the class; such as qualified Life Science tutors. Some of this is seen with success rates in our tested SLO's. Nearly 1/2 of the students did not meet expectations with regards to understanding transcription and translation of DNA. It is possible that the students need more resources to get a better grasp of this subject matter. The students were given a practice handout they could work on before the exam. Perhaps some of the students merely copied answers from others instead of working through and gaining a better understanding of the process at hand. It could also be that the students did not understand how to perform the task and needed additional help, which was not sought.

Another area we are wondering about regards our Majors Level courses. Although the success rates are high in these courses, "success" as currently defined (grade of 'C' or better) does not

reflect the reality of future "success" for the students in Life Science and Allied Health majors. In other words, a grade of 'C' will get you an A.S. degree, but your chances of getting into a Nursing program with this grade in a core course are very remote. Typically these programs require a minimum of a 'B' to get in, and for highly competitive programs (such as BC Nursing) it frequently requires straight 'A's in those core courses. Furthermore, a large number of our students are the first college students in their family. They may not fully comprehend the fact that merely obtaining a degree does not guarantee that they will achieve their goal of getting into more competitive programs. In this sense, we wonder if we are really doing our students justice to have them settle for grades that will only get them a degree and not a career. We wonder if the students would benefit with mentoring from TC Alumni who have gone on to colleges and programs in these fields and become successful in their careers.

**MATH SCI Physical Science**

We have been able to successfully keep modern, functioning, relevant equipment and instrumentation in the hands of our physical science students. We believe that providing these experiences, driven by student learning objectives and measured outcomes (SLOs), had a direct impact on student success rates in physical science courses as observed in our student success data and SLOs. Additionally, we feel that having full-time faculty teaching hands on face to face courses has contributed to the success of these students. We wonder if more resources not only in the lecture/lab setting, but in the form of content specific tutoring would help increase student success. For example, an SLO measured in general chemistry required a multistep problem solving strategy. All students showed mastery in the initial steps, while 30% of students failed to demonstrate complete mastery. We wonder if greater access to content specific tutors would have helped these students.

## III: What If

**ENGL English AA & AA-T Degrees**

As mentioned above, implementing the Growth Mindset conversation and a student equity worker improved the completion rate in ENGL 800. Professor Carlson will continue to implement both of these this semester as well. In the Growth Mindset meetings dialogue has occurred throughout the semester about the various approaches used in classes in multiple disciplines in regards to strategies that are working well and those that are not. Also, Avid for Higher Education is another conversation that is taking place and will be implemented across campus, but particularly in basic skills classes. Hopefully, since the findings about Growth Mindset have shown to improve persistence and retention, they will be implemented campus-wide. This is a scalable intervention. In the short term, continuing this approach in all pre-collegiate English courses--especially ENGL 1000--is critical.

The Online Education Initiative's forthcoming Course Exchange may provide students majoring in English more opportunities to complete list A courses in the major. Offering our own list A courses on the exchange would boost enrollment. It is critical that at least two different literature courses from list A be offered every semester so that those students choosing English as their major have the ability to complete the requirements within two years. The data provided by IAR&P, which indicate the courses completed by every student majoring in English, could be used in advance of scheduling meetings to strategically determine which list A classes are most needed, but doing so might change the six-year schedule of literature offerings that has already been shared with students and would require detailed information about each student's goals (UC Pathway requires 2700; 1700 series is not UC-Transferrable).

**INST SRVCS Distance Learning Support**

1. Contact DE students who have not participated in their first week of DE classes. This activity would help retention rates and may also impact success rates of DE students.

2. Continue to offer professional development to all DE faculty regarding the use of the Canvas LMS. The outcome of this activity is to have all DE faculty feel prepared to utilize the Canvas LMS features to effectively and efficiently conduct their online classes.

3. Work with Student Services to increase the frequency and the quality of online contacts between DE students and the various areas of student services. The desired outcome of this activity is to have our DE students have a greater sense of community with the college even though they may rarely or never travel to the campus.

4. Purchase textbooks for the TCI and MCCF incarcerated students. This activity will improve the access to college classes for the incarcerated students. With this improved access, we should see enrollment numbers increase.

5. Establish twice-monthly support group meetings with the MCCF inmates who are serving as Dorm Reps for our college. The rational of this activity is to encourage the development of skills and behaviors of student success which the Dorm Reps would model to the larger incarcerated population.

6. Establish a MOU agreement between the college and the TC Faculty Association to permit willing faculty to conduct some, or all, of their TCI/MCCF class inside the prison facilities. The anticipated outcome of this activity is to improve the quality of instruction provided to the

**PRES Human Resources**

1. Recruitment and hiring of an Administrative Assistant to the AVP of Human Resources, to provide specialized operations support and coordination of the increased HR related activities associated with implementation 2016-17 program review goals, board policies, HR procedures, HR initiatives, county, state and federal compliance, as aligned with the Equal Opportunity Plan, Title 5 Regulations and the Taft College Mission.

2. Establish an annual funding source and budget dedicated to equally support professional development activities for faculty, staff and management, as aligned with the Taft College Strategic Action Plan and Professional Development Plan.

3. Recruitment and hiring of a human resources manager or director to provide analytical and technical human resource leadership expertise of the increased HR related activities associated with implementation 2016-17 program review goals, board policies, HR procedures, HR initiatives, county, state and federal compliance, as aligned with the Equal Opportunity Plan, Title 5 Regulations and the Taft College Mission.

**MATH SCI Natural and Life Sciences**

In order to accommodate more students and offer additional sections of these core courses, we would need to hire additional qualified Life Science faculty and secure additional classroom/lab space. We have begun to offer additional sections in the G8 lab, which was originally used for Life Science courses. Most of our equipment was purchased with grant monies over 5 years ago. As this equipment ages we will need to repair/replace it to maintain our high course success rates. Furthermore, as we add more sections and students, we will need additional lab equipment and supplies to ensure that all students have equal access to success. In order to increase student success further, particularly in the 1500-level courses taken by non-majors, we would like to have a full-time Life Science tutor and a dedicated space for student interaction (e.g. Math Lab and English Lab), such as ConnExpo.

To improve grades, and career outcomes, in our core Life Science and Allied Health courses we propose: 1. Identifying TC Alumni who have gone through Life Science and Allied Health programs, 2. Bring them together with current students through interactive picnics, meetings, and functions, 3. Foster a mentor/mentee program with these contacts. We propose the activity be called: Alumni/Student Interactive Family (ASIF).

**MATH SCI Physical Science**

What if we procured additional permanent dedicated physical science lab space with appropriate student stations, adequate storage facilities and proper ventilation? A multipurpose lab in which introductory chemistry, physics and other physical science courses could be offered. Would it allow more students to finish all program requirements and prerequisites at TC?

In recent years the budgets of physical science faculty have remained flat while vendor pricing and number of course sections have steadily increased. If we are to sustain and continue to improve student success in the physical sciences, it is critical that we not only maintain, but annually increase budgetary allotments.

## IV: Goals

**ENGL English AA & AA-T Degrees**

1. Increase successful course completion rates for ENGL 1000 in spring of 2017 and fall of 2017 by implementing the growth mindset, revising the COR to align with the C-ID descriptor, utilizing affective and cognitive approaches, embedding student equity workers, and working with counseling and assessment to explore the impact of placement into ENGL 1000.

2. Increase the number of English majors awarded an AA-T in English to at least 7 in 2016/2017 by continuing to offer at least two courses in list A of the major per semester, examining the progress of each student majoring in English in completing coursework to inform scheduling decisions, achieving professional development in online instruction, and preparing for participation in the OEI course exchange when it is launched.

3. Increase the number of students assessed for the PSLO "Evaluate expository and literary texts" by 100% to determine if this outcome needs additional support or intervention. The PSLO's relevance to the mission of the program and alignment with CSLOs and course curriculum should also be examined.

**INST SRVCS Distance Learning Support**

1. Improve the retention rates of the DE students by 1%.

2. Improve the success rates of DE students by 2%.

3. All DE faculty will trained to use the Canvas LMS.

4. 70% of all DE students will have a greater sense of community with the college.

5. The enrollment numbers for the TCI and MCCF incarcerated population will increase by 20%.

6. Improve the retention rates of the incarcerated students by 3%.

7. Improve the success rates of the incarcerated students by 2%.

**PRES Human Resources**

1. Increase qualified diverse employee hires by 2% for faculty, staff and management employees.

2. Establish a comprehensive professional development program with an annual budget increase of 3% that is equally funded for faculty, staff and management employees.

**MATH SCI Natural and Life Sciences**

1. Increase student success in the 1500-level courses.

2. Increase student retention and graduation rates

3. Reduce time to degree

4. Provide more authentic and higher quality of education to the students

All of these would be achieved by the following:

1. Hire additional Life Science faculty.

2. Hire qualified Life Science tutor.

3. Increase our adjunct pool.

4. Attend professional development training and conferences.

5. Repair and replace equipment as it becomes antiquated.

6. Obtain additional laboratory space, preferably dedicate G8 to Life Science usage.

7. Build an Alumni Student Interactive Family (ASIF).

**MATH SCI Physical Science**

1. Build a permanent, dedicated, multipurpose physical science lab space with appropriate student stations, adequate storage facilities and proper ventilation. A room in which introductory chemistry, physics and other physical science courses could be offered.

2. Hire a highly qualified full-time tenure track chemistry faculty member that will enable the growth of the physical science department.

3. Continue to maintain and upgrade lab equipment, instrumentation, and supplies in all areas of physical science instruction to reflect current scientific applications.